



**TNE_QA Promoting quality and recognition of
transnational education in Armenia and Georgia**

Wrap-up of the workgroups Suggested indicators

Batumi, 23-24 June 2015

Note

This document presents the indicators suggested in the workgroups that took place during the Batumi seminar.

It is to be considered as a working document. A finalised document, reviewed and incorporating the data from the questionnaires filled in by the partners will be circulated for comments in preparation of the Paris workshop



Programmes – 1

Ensure that the programmes they deliver across borders and in their home country are of comparable quality.



Programmes 1 – General

- Comparable and documented student assessment processes
- Comparable access to learning resources
- Comparable recruitment mechanisms for staff (both faculty and administrative)



Programmes 1 – Institutional

- The institution demonstrates strategic commitment to TNE.
- Comparable approach / mechanism to develop ILOs



Programmes 1 – Programme

- Comparable levels of intended learning outcomes (not as content but at level)



Programmes – 2

Ensure that the programmes they deliver across borders and in their home country take into account the cultural and linguistic sensitivities of the receiving country.

Programmes – 2

- The curricula are compliant with the professional and national qualification frameworks (especially for regulated professions) or professional associations.
- The institution uses authentic teaching material adapted to local and cultural sensitivities.
- The institution uses teaching methodology adapted to local and cultural sensitivities.
- The institution provides linguistic and cultural support to students.

Faculty

Recognise that quality teaching is made possible by the quality of faculty and the quality of their working conditions that foster independent and critical enquiry.



Faculty

- Existence of a clear policy for teaching staff, in terms of qualification, professional experience and staff category
- Existence of clear academic staff selection and promotion procedures
- Compliance with home country requirements (also professional and industrial)
- Existence of workload policy for teaching/research and administrative duties
- Provision for involving professional experts
- Provision to ensure of continuity of cooperation
- Existence of mutual agreements of cooperation about faculty qualification and teaching conditions





Faculty

- Existence and regular review of the evaluation of teaching by the students and administration
- Clear policy to evaluate how they cover learning outcomes
- Policy and resources for retraining & continuous improvement of faculty
- Working condition and access to IT, labs, teaching instruments for teaching and research
- Existence of policy to guarantee academic freedom and participation of the stakeholders





Internal Quality Assurance

Develop, maintain or review current internal quality management systems so that they make full use of the competencies of stakeholders such as academic staff, administrators, students and graduates and take full responsibility for delivering higher education qualifications comparable in standard in their home country and across borders.



Internal Quality Assurance

- IQA systems are based in a comparable quality policy
- IQA systems ensure comparable student recruitment processes at home and host institution
- IQA systems involve relevant stakeholders in its information collection processes (students, staff, graduates and employers surveys)
- IQA regulations ensure that the staff and students are represented in decision making in an equal manner (percentage of representation)





Internal Quality Assurance

- IQA systems include competency assessment procedures to make sure that graduates are of comparable level
- IQA systems cover comparable criteria and procedures for academic staff and administrators performance reviews
- IQA systems include comparable and explicit procedures for academic programme review
- IQA systems offer comparable opportunities for professional development of staff





External Quality Assurance

Consult competent quality assurance and accreditation bodies and respect the quality assurance and accreditation systems of the receiving country when delivering higher education across borders, including distance education.



External quality assurance

- Consult competent quality assurance and accreditation bodies and respect the quality assurance and accreditation systems of receiving country when delivering higher education across borders, including distance learning.



External quality assurance

- **Policy**

Have policy/regulation which includes the mandatory consultation of relevant accreditation information worldwide which is relevant for the provision AND to map alignment with accreditation standards in receiving country

=> A numerical quantifier can be set to allow level of variation to such standards



External quality assurance

- Procedural/operational

Have as part of IQA various levels of engagement with such external reference points to monitor alignment/compliance with ...

1. Include as part of periodic review (with external input)
2. Include as part of annual monitoring/assessment/evaluation (with internal resources)

=> Results to be made accessible, visible with various levels of details for internal/external audiences

3. Allocate responsibility to a job role to continuously monitor and report on updates to relevant committees



External quality assurance

BIG QUESTION !!!!

Consult competent quality assurance and accreditation bodies and respect the quality assurance and accreditation systems of receiving country when delivering higher education across borders, including distance learning.

Should accreditation by receiving body be compulsory (may result in double accreditation)? – as an indicator



Good Practices

Share good practices by participating in sector organisations and inter-institutional networks at national and international level.



Good practices

Preamble

- By network, the following are included:
 - University networks (teaching, programmes) scientific cooperation and research)
 - Networks for students and teachers mobility
 - Professional networks (employability and qualification recognition)



Good practices

- Selection
 - Institutions should have a clear policy to select the networks it will participate in. Participation is inscribed in the strategic plan
 - Institution should review regularly the participation to make sure that it participates to the relevant professional networks and organisations
 - The network should include institutions from the home country
- Participation
 - Institution devotes resources (financial, human...) and support for the participation in the networks
 - The institution should maintain regular and active participation to the network

Good practices

- Evaluation and review
 - There should be benchmarks with other institutions
 - The institution should monitor the functioning and outcomes of the partnership
 - For all networks, there should be a tracking system and monitoring policy, together with evidences collection to see how they participate to quality enhancement



National and International Networking

Develop and maintain networks and partnerships to facilitate the process of recognition by acknowledging each other's qualifications as equivalent or comparable.



National and International Networking

- The institution demonstrates strategic commitment to internationalisation.
- Membership of the institution or its staff and faculty in international networks
- Participation in international events and projects
- Effective multilateral agreements and partnerships (evidences should demonstrate impact)





National and International Networking

- Use of internationally recognised mechanisms and tools aimed at helping the recognition of qualifications (e.g. diploma supplements, ECTS, others)
- The institution promotes mobility through partnerships for academic exchange, student exchange, internships, etc.
- Participation in sectoral, inter-sectoral and inter-institutional networks (e.g. knowledge transfers) – already covered by Good Practices





Information

When promoting their programmes to potential students through agents, they should take full responsibility to ensure that the information and guidance provided by their agents are accurate, reliable and easily accessible

Information

- Information material with accurate data and linked to the university's website available for distribution by agents
- Monitoring mechanisms for agents in place (e.g. surveys among students recruited through agents)

Information

Provide accurate, reliable and easily accessible information on the criteria and procedures of external and internal quality assurance and the academic and professional recognition of qualifications they deliver and provide complete description of programmes and qualifications, preferably with descriptions of the knowledge, understanding and skills that a successful student should acquire.



Information

- Information on EQA of programmes publicly available on university's website (with links to accreditation agencies' website) and relevant information material
- Information on EQA of programmes publicly available on recognition status on the website and relevant information material
- Information on IQA system of the university
- Information on ILOs, a list of courses and credits, teaching learning process and assessment system, duration of the programme
- Information on the qualification provided and how it relates to national qualification

Information

- Information on the profile of the teachers, CV attached, a list of publications and contact details
- Statistics indicators on selectivity at the entry, study success and labour market entry
- Information on tuition fees and available scholarships
- Information on the selection process and criteria to the programme (e.g. prerequisites, expected grades, other experiences)
- Information on opportunity for mobility
- Information on study environment and student services



Information

Higher education institutions/providers should collaborate especially with quality assurance and accreditation bodies and with student bodies to facilitate the dissemination of information.



Information

- Quality assurance bodies informed about the nature of TNE programme
- Student bodies informed about the nature of TNE programme



Compliance with international codes and practices

Where relevant, use codes of good practice such as the UNESCO/Council of Europe 'Code of good practice in the provision of transnational education' and other relevant codes such as the Council of Europe/UNESCO 'Recommendation on Criteria and Procedures for the Assessment of Foreign Qualifications'.



Governance and financial management

Ensure the transparency of the financial status of the institution and/or educational programme offered.



Governance and financial management

- Strategy => necessity for TNE-specific budget
- Checking of financial sustainability (**NOT** comparability)
- Publication of information

How?

Currently financial statement and projection => translatable in an easily comprehensible template (not full disclosure)

On website must be in local and international language

What?

Scholarships, Mobility grants, Research grants – full disclosure



Governance and financial management

- Closure of programmes

Financial sustainability => University has responsibility
=> For non-accredited programmes – no safety net by Ministry

QA sustainability

⇒ For accredited programmes – Ministry has responsibility for students (ADVANTAGE for mandatory accreditation)